



Critical Care Mentoring Study: Testing a Program to Enhance Recruitment and Retention of Nurses

Debra A. Bournes, RN; PhD
Carolyn Plummer, RN; MHSc

Quality Worklife-Quality Healthcare Collaborative 5th Annual Summit
March 3, 2011

Research Team

- Debra A. Bournes, RN; PhD
- Carolyn Plummer, RN; MHSc
- Jane Hollett, RN; MSc
- Mary Ferguson-Paré, RN; PhD

Background

- Recruitment and retention crisis
- Staff satisfaction and morale
- Focus on mid-career nurses
- Previous research

Purpose of the Study

- Evaluate the impact of a mentoring program with
 - Experienced critical care nurses, and
 - New graduate nurses interested in a career in critical care
- Enhance nurse mentoring capacity

Purpose of the Study

- Extend knowledge about the effectiveness and generalizability of the humanbecoming 80-20 professional development program
- Evaluate a mentoring program for staff nurses

Research Question 1

- What is the meaning of participating in the humanbecoming 80-20 mentoring program?
- Objectives are to describe:
 - the significance of participating in the humanbecoming 80-20 mentoring program;
 - ways of relating with others that emerge through the mentoring program; and
 - changes that have occurred through participating in the program.

Methodology for Question 1

- Qualitative descriptive:
 - Interviews were conducted with participants prior to and following the study intervention.

Pre-Project Questions

What is the meaning of mentorship to you?

What kinds of relationships are important in mentoring?

What do you hope to learn in the HB80-20 mentoring program?

Post-Project Questions

Describe your experience of participating in the HB80-20 mentoring program. What was it like? What was most important to you?

How did your relationships change during and after the program?

What have you learned? How are you different?

Research Question 2

- What is the difference in nurse satisfaction, sick time, overtime, and retention when the humanbecoming 80-20 mentoring program is implemented at one year after the introduction of the program, for each cohort group?

Methodology for Question 2

- Longitudinal, repeated measures descriptive-comparative design:
 - Analyzed trends and looked for differences that arose in staff turnover rates, sick time, overtime, agency use, education hours, and staff satisfaction.

Participants

- New graduate nurses (protégés):
 - 13 participants
 - Ranged in years of experience from 1-1.5 years
 - Participants were from a variety of units/programs across all three sites of University Health Network
- Experienced critical care nurses (mentors):
 - 11 participants
 - Ranged in years of experience from 6-28 years
 - Participants were from MSICU, CVICU, and CICU.
 - All potential mentor participants were required to complete a written application and provide a reference.

Cohort Groups

Experienced critical care nurse
participants from the study
units

Compared
to

Experienced critical care nurse
non-participants from the study
units

New graduate nurse
participants at UHN

Compared
to

New graduate nurse
non-participants at UHN

Experienced critical care nurse
participants from the study
units COMBINED WITH new
graduate nurse
participants at UHN

Compared
to

Experienced critical care nurse
non-participants from the study
units COMBINED WITH new
graduate nurse
non-participants at UHN

Study Intervention

- Humanbecoming 80-20 professional development program:
 - Nurses spent 80% of their salaried time in direct patient care and 20% of their salaried time on professional development.
 - Focused on learning about humanbecoming-guided nursing practice, mentoring, and leading-following through structured teaching-learning sessions.

Study Intervention

- In addition:
 - the experienced critical care nurses participated in a mentoring program, and
 - all participants spent time together in mentoring dyads, and engaged in independent professional development activities.

How the Time was Spent

Months 1-4

Months 5-12

Structured education program that introduced participants to theory-guided practice and mentoring model

25 – 30% structured education program with on-going learning about theory-guided practice, mentoring, and leadership

70 – 75% individualized professional development activities and one-on-one mentoring time in mentor-protégé dyads

Professional Development

- Nursing research – grieving study
- Best of Nursing participation and interviews
- Clinically relevant courses
- CNA Certification
- Evidence-based practice initiatives
- Pursuing undergraduate and graduate education
- Unit-based policy development
- Conference and seminar attendance and participation
- Developing professional portfolios & resumes
- Developing wellness programs for unit
- Unit-based Professional Practice Council participation
- Team-building and morale improvement project
- Green Team participation
- Computer training
- Volunteering with Cancer Society
- Assisting with developing medical directives
- Developing orientation packages for new nurses
- Review and revision of unit-specific resources
- Intra/Interprofessional collaboration initiatives



MENTORING EXPERIENCES

Mentoring Experiences

- In pairs, take turns asking each other the following questions:
 - Think about a time when you were involved in a meaningful and helpful mentoring relationship as a protégé.
 - What did that look like for you?
 - What do you remember most about that experience?
 - What made it memorable?
 - When you are in a mentoring role:
 - What are the things you value as a mentor?
 - How do you want to live your role as a mentor?

Mentoring in This Study Is...

- Mentoring is a cocreated reality surfacing in the process of becoming for mentor and protégé (Parse, 2008). It is:
 - A special and unique relationship that is focused on mutual engagement for the purpose of enrichment, expansion, and possibility.
 - A process that evolves in the now with a preparing for the not-yet.
 - Satisfying and rewarding for persons involved.
 - A commitment to growth and possibility (Mitchell, 2008).



STUDY FINDINGS

Mentor Findings

- The meaning and importance of mentoring
 - Pre-Project Theme: Guiding and Sharing Knowledge and Skills
 - Making someone feel comfortable in stressful situations
 - Providing assistance with professional and educational decision-making
 - Helping protégés get through the system
 - Setting a good example as a role model
 - Post-Project Theme: Enlightening Knowledge Sharing
 - Rewarding reinforcement of beliefs about nursing
 - Frustrating learning about humanbecoming
 - Refreshing opportunity for professional development
 - Engaging with a variety of perspectives
 - Enjoying mentoring with freedom of thought

Mentor Findings

- Mentoring relationships
 - Pre-Project Theme: Appreciating Differences with Respect
 - Listening carefully to protégés
 - Trusting and supporting connections
 - Enhancing job performance
 - Learning about self
 - Being available in collegial way
 - Having open communication
 - Nurturing others to understand environment
 - Post-Project Theme: Enhancing Understanding of Others
 - Listening more sympathetically
 - Developing trusting connections
 - Changing attitude
 - Appreciating differences
 - Being more understanding

Mentor Findings

- Learning through the project
 - Pre-Project Theme: Enhancing Knowledge for Self and Others
 - Learning about humanbecoming
 - Rejuvenating love for nursing
 - Investigating different career paths
 - Guiding another properly
 - Improving communication skills
 - Helping to keep others in nursing
 - Post-Project Theme: Changing Views
 - Learning about humanbecoming
 - Rejuvenating love for nursing
 - Appreciating diverse views
 - Asking different questions
 - Being more open to new ideas

Protégé Findings

- The meaning and importance of mentoring
 - Pre-Project Theme: Being Guided Regarding Knowledge and Skills
 - Having someone to help in stressful situations
 - Getting assistance from experienced professionals
 - Having a networking opportunity
 - Learning to build confidence
 - Post-Project Theme: Being in a Supportive Environment
 - Having an opportunity for professional development
 - Applying Parse's theory
 - Being inspired by experiences
 - Having time to reflect

Protégé Findings

- Mentoring relationships
 - Pre-Project Theme: Communicating with Honesty and Respect
 - Having a friendly connection with a balance of power
 - Trusting and supporting opportunities to discuss
 - Caring with patience
 - Reassuring safe and comfortable approach
 - Protecting privacy
 - Honoring each other with mutual understanding
 - Post-Project Theme: Appreciating Diversity
 - Respecting others' views
 - Focusing on persons without judging
 - Listening attentively to unique stories
 - Being more understanding
 - Gaining new friends

Protégé Findings

- Learning through the project
 - Pre-Project Theme: Enhancing Knowledge and Understanding
 - Learning about humanbecoming
 - Gaining a better understanding of relationships with patients
 - Making my job more satisfying
 - Having an opportunity to explore different avenues
 - Understanding self
 - Post-Project Theme: Everchanging Personal Perspective
 - Opening doors for understanding humanbecoming
 - Becoming more well-rounded
 - Seeing the big picture
 - Acquiring new insights about people and nursing
 - Understanding self

Research Question 2

- Data was gathered from finance, payroll, and other sources for one year prior to the study intervention, the intervention period, and the three month period following the intervention.

Findings – Research Question 2

- Nurse Satisfaction
- Sick time
- Overtime
- Retention

Additional Learnings

- Humanbecoming/80-20 model implementation with nurses from various areas versus an intact unit
 - Affected validity of staff satisfaction tool used
 - Model has greater impact from a financial perspective when used on entire units (better value for money)
- Supporting leaders on units with participating nurses
- Assumptions about nurses having mentors
- Loss of momentum during summer months (fewer structured seminars)
- More structure for projects and project management
- Most participants recommend this opportunity for all nurses

Questions???

- For more information about this study, please contact:
 - Debra A. Bournes at Debra.Bournes@uhn.on.ca
 - Carolyn Plummer at Carolyn.Plummer@uhn.on.ca